



# City of Madison

City of Madison  
Madison, WI 53703  
www.cityofmadison.com

## Meeting Minutes - Approved URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

---

Wednesday, July 1, 2009

4:30 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.  
LL-110 (Madison Municipal Building)

---

### CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Barnett arrived at 4:37 p.m. after approval of the Minutes. Rummel arrived at 4:49 p.m. during Item Number 2. Luskin arrived at 4:30 p.m. during Item Number 2.

**Present:** 8 -

Marsha A. Rummel; Mark M. Smith; Dawn O. Weber; Bruce F. Woods;  
Ronald S. Luskin; R. Richard Wagner; Todd R. Barnett and Richard L.  
Slayton

**Excused:** 2 -

John A. Harrington and Jay B. Fern

### APPROVAL OF MINUTES

**A motion was made by Slayton, seconded by Weber, to Approve the Minutes of the June 17, 2009 meeting. The motion was passed by voice vote/other.**

### PUBLIC COMMENT

### ANNOUNCEMENTS

- Possible cancellation of July 29, 2009 special meeting
- Agenda overview

### PUBLIC HEARING ITEM

1. [15202](#) 720 John Nolen Drive - Street Graphics Variance. 14th Ald. Dist.  
  
The motion required the elimination of unsightly landscaping at the base with appropriate landscaping to be reviewed and approved by staff.  
  
**A motion was made by Wagner, seconded by Smith, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

### SPECIAL ITEMS OF BUSINESS

2. [15195](#) Report of the Facade Improvement Grant Staff Team - 555 State Street (Fat Sandwich Company), 627-631 State Street (U.S. Cellular), 924 Williamson Street (Plan B), and 2205 Sherman Avenue (Madison Chiropractic).

**A motion was made by Wagner, seconded by Weber, to Approve the Report of the Facade Improvement Grant Staff Team (555 State Street). The motion passed by the following vote:**

**Excused:** 2 -

John A. Harrington and Jay B. Ferm

**Ayes:** 4 -

Mark M. Smith; Dawn O. Weber; Bruce F. Woods and R. Richard Wagner

**Abstentions:** 2 -

Marsha A. Rummel and Ronald S. Luskin

**A motion was made by Luskin, seconded by Smith, to Approve the Report of the Facade Improvement Grant Staff Team (627-631 State Street). The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

**A motion was made by Rummel, seconded by Luskin, to Approve the Report of the Facade Improvement Grant Staff Team (924 Williamson Street). The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

**A motion was made by Luskin, seconded by Weber, to Approve the Report of the Facade Improvement Grant Staff Team (2205 Sherman Avenue). The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

### **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

3. [13195](#) 1900 East Washington Avenue - PUD(GDP-SIP), Mixed-Use Development in Urban Design District No. 4. 12th Ald. Dist.  

The motion provided that signage be limited on the stair tower panels to the concept of the building's name, "Emerson Place" as presented and provided in the packet; not to be utilized for sale or lease usage. The motion also required the provision of an 8-inch minimum base in the arcade of either block or aluminum. In addition, the full details of the signage package still requires formal consideration by the Commission.

**A motion was made by Luskin, seconded by Smith, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**
4. [14907](#) 400 State Street - Lisa Link Peace Park Improvements in the C4 District. 4th Ald. Dist.  

**The Urban Design Commission Received an Informational Presentation**
5. [12028](#) 100 North Hamilton Street - Accessory Building, Minor Facade and Site Alterations in the C4 District. 4th Ald. Dist.  

The motion requested that the applicant look at a way to find or provide a cleaner, clearer route to the exhibit area with staff approval.

A motion was made by Barnett, seconded by Rummel, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

6. [14911](#)

115 & 117 South Bassett Street - PUD(GDP-SIP) for the Conversion of a Single-Family Home into a Three-Unit and a Three-Unit into a Four-Unit Building plus a new five-unit house. 4th Ald. Dist.

The motion required address of the following stated concerns:

- Elevations are improved but fail to provide for appropriate notation and detailing to provide for their readable identification.
- A request by the Commission for staff to reference the previous comments on the project from the meeting of June 17, 2009 was provided and summarized as follows:
- Issue with the amount of paved surface at the rear of the combined buildings. Eliminate one driveway with the remainder to provide access.
- Question the development of a PUD as a tool to do what variance can't do. Question the public purpose.
- Need to provide a complete site plan including a complete PUD with complete build-out that includes the future Phase 2 coach houses proposal.
- Architecture as is now is unacceptable, not good enough as a PUD; inappropriate use of PUD zoning.
- Need complete site plan, provide photographs for context including aerial photo that provides details on the density and bulk of adjacent development.
- Need full details on the PUD submittal including better architecture. Provide better graphics including details on the ground plane, the physical appearance of the buildings, provide drawings that show and clearly delineate the project as proposed.
- Would support carriage house developments as exist on Williamson Street but project as proposed is not there without the details.
- Look at proportions of the building elevations in conjunction with the appearance of proportions of existing buildings in the area to work as a guide in the redesign of the building to be in character with the architecture of adjacent existing contemporary residential buildings, in addition rework window locations and proportions at the buildings proposed to be modified.
- Consider a full two-story version of the building at 115 South Bassett; would work better than three as proposed.
- Deal with pasted on dormers that were only done to get more space.
- Resolve issues with architecture.
- Make 115 a different building than what is being done to 117 South Bassett; and
- Provide complete site context in relationship to adjacent properties'

information, as well as aerial photographs.

- Reduce the amount of pavement over both combined lots, including abandoning one of the two drives.
- Look at stretching out the back of 115 South Bassett in order to maintain its appearance at the street with a rear addition and eliminate the proposed third story.
- Provide more architecture beyond adoption of features from the adjoining house. Make the architecture for 115 South Bassett a departure from that proposed for 117 South Bassett. Provide architectural detailing on both buildings comparable to that on adjacent similar structures.
- Provide a complete site plan and other details that include the proposed future phase coach houses to be developed at the rear of the property.
- Provide architectural detailing to the level of PUD that includes professionally rendered building elevations, site and landscape plans including the ground plane fully delineated and specifics of the full scope of the project.
- Agree with improvements to plans but still need to see concept of full build-out with coach house and site plan details.
- For a PUD need to see carriage house details where the new modifications not as good as existing traditional three-flats within the area.

In response to a request by the Commission, staff outlined the requirements for a submission of a PUD-GDP dealing with the development of coach houses on the site, which minimally required a zoning text providing for use and occupancy of the sites and buildings, a site plan that reflects the bulk and mass of the proposed structures in context with the existing first phase development, including an overall site/landscape plan concept and a conceptual rendering or elevation on the physical appearance of the coach houses at minimum.

Following staff's comments the Commission noted the following:

- There is a problem with the blank expression on the left elevation of 115 South Bassett. Also on the rear right elevation of 117 South Bassett Street.
- Maintain appearance of a 2-story at the street side elevation of 115 South Bassett with an enlargement at the building's rear.
- Provide photos of adjacent properties for context.
- Match new windows to style of building and other period buildings in the area.
- Provisions for the use of metal roofing and fiber cement siding are OK.
- Need to act on previous request by the Commission, need to provide

package consistent with the requirements for a PUD, along with the need to provide for an adequate level of design.

- The number of units may require attention to the building and fire codes.
- Suggest providing stepback of the building profile at the street to provide setbacks at the various levels for the building at 115 South Bassett.
- The long dormers need work in conjunction with the maintenance of the peak of the existing gabled roof, or make pitch higher and increase pitch of dormer along with breaking up the mass of dormers.
- Adjust interior floor plans to allow for window placement and openings in a more logical and balanced fashion on the buildings' exterior.
- There is enough room to double the size of the site plan on existing plan sheets to make them more readable and legible.
- Check out conditions contained within this report and the previous report as a checklist prior to submission of the project for any further consideration.
- Look at balcony depth to a minimum of 5-6 feet to be more usable on all floors for all buildings.
- The applicant was strongly encouraged to provide for preparation of revised plans by his architect including the architect's attendance for future consideration of the project.
- When project is resubmitted for further consideration provide clear documentation on the drawings on the before and after conditions, including materials with drawings required to be of the same scale, along with providing window conditions such as picture framing, lintels and sills as well as corner board and gable end rake treatment and other amenities customary to the period of the buildings' architecture and adjacent structures.

**A motion was made by Luskin, seconded by Rummel, to Refer to the URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

#### **BUSINESS BY MEMBERS**

- Member appointments

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

**A motion was made by Wagner, seconded by Rummel, to Adjourn at 7:30 p.m. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**