



# City of Madison

City of Madison  
Madison, WI 53703  
www.cityofmadison.com

## Meeting Minutes - Approved TRANSIT AND PARKING COMMISSION

---

Tuesday, May 27, 2008

5:00 PM

Madison Central Public Library  
201 W. Mifflin Street  
Room 202, Front Lecture Room

---

### A. CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Staff: Colin Conn, Sharon Persich, Tim Sobota, Chuck Kamp, Ann Schroeder

Chair DuRocher called the meeting to order at 5:04 PM.

Present: 6 -

Brian L. Solomon; Carl D. Durocher; Gary Poulson; Duane F. Hinz; Kevin L. Hoag and Kenneth M. Streit

Absent: 2 -

Jed Sanborn and Sharon L. McCabe

Excused: 2 -

Robbie Webber and Amanda F. White

### B. TPC REVIEW OF AND ACTION ON MADISON METRO TRANSIT'S REVISED RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FALL 2008 SERVICE CHANGES

Kamp, Metro General Manager, referred to the financial summary handed out that was based on an October 5, 2008 implementation date for the route changes. Metro staff looked at all the factors and decided that October 5th was an achievable implementation date in order to make all necessary changes, including those to public information materials. Costs for service changes with more drastic cuts for Route 13 would impact contingency at \$21,606. If money were found for Route 13 from another source, the contingency request would be \$52,606. Metro currently has a contingency of approximately \$700,000, but with estimated overages of \$1 million for fuel, they scaled back their requests.

Staff clarified information provided to the Commission about the current proposals.

- Route 3 – Due to feedback at the public hearing, this route, with the exception of one trip, will remain essentially the same as it is now.
- Route 6 – Regarding service to Madison Area Technical College (MATC), Route 4 will pick up some service on weekdays. Route 6 won't serve MATC on weekends at all, but all Route 20 trips will serve MATC on weekends, for a net increase of weekend service.
- Route 19 – The last trip off the square on this route is 10:45 PM, which is not a change.
- Route 20 – This will be changed to include a modification of the current loop to Kinsman Road. It will serve Kinsman only East of Highway 51, allowing service to an apartment complex where Metro got feedback about losing weekend service with the first proposal.
- Route 21 – It is correct that there are no changes. However, Route 20 to the

airport will be hourly at night. Route 4 will also be hourly.

- Route 24 – This route is eliminated.
- Route 26 – This will have hourly mid-day service. There will be a total of six trips to bridge the gap between the AM and PM peak Route 25.
- Route 30 – This route will have an extended service day with trips half an hour earlier in the AM and half an hour later in the PM.
- Route 33 – Some evenings trips were eliminated. This is a lightly used route that has parallel service on Route 32.
- Route 34 – This is an underserved route, so Metro takes any opportunity to add trips when it is cost neutral. A trip servicing MATC has been added at 3:15.
- Route 39 – The 6:15 AM trip is eliminated. The driver on this route said it is used by about one person twice a week.
- Route 40 – The description about the changes to this route mentioned Route 48. It should have said Route 44.
- Route 44 – The original proposal made a lot of changes to Routes 37 and 38 and added Route 10 during peak times. Budget concerns caused this proposal to eliminate Route 10. Due to that elimination, Metro modified Route 38 to respond to public comments. Sheboygan Avenue is served with Route 44, so Route 37 and 38 were not needed there. Route 44 will use Park Street rather than Fisher and Grand.

Solomon moved to suspend the rules and take questions. Hinz seconded. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

County Board Supervisor Sheila Stubbs said that due to the fact that Route 13 has high ridership, she wondered why that would even be considered for reduction. Kamp said during discussions, Metro checked to see if there are other things that could be cut to help the Town of Madison with their \$26,000 short fall for service. Other routes were considered, but one goes through the South Transfer Point and one goes to job centers and impacted multiple municipalities. Staff doesn't enjoy doing this kind of exercise. Metro is really trying to run a regional system but dealing with multiple municipal budgets. Route 13 impacted only the City of Madison and Town of Madison. Metro felt this met the municipal budget criteria and was the least painful of the options available.

A document was handed out that was labeled feedback submitted 5/15 to 5/27. One audience member, Tom Mertz, was concerned because he had furnished feedback during this time, and his was not included. He was concerned that there could be other feedback as well that was not included in the document given to the Commission. Poulson said if he wanted to give his feedback, he could register to speak at the meeting. Kamp said Metro attempted to get all feedback and apologized that his was not listed.

Regarding Route 13, Ray Harmon from the Mayor's Office said that they had worked with the Town of Madison and Dane County on the \$26,000 budget shortfall. Harmon said there had been numerous meetings with the Town of Madison, Metro and the County Executive's office and thanked everyone for working hard. They are still trying to explore funding possibilities, but the Mayor was not willing to fund a budget hole for the Town of Madison because it would not be not fair to other municipalities who don't have the same situation.

The Commission then took registrants who wanted to speak on the issue of the route changes.

Ron Cook, 540 W Olin Avenue, - He is concerned about the changes to Route 13, as he assumes there won't be money for the more fully funded route. The loop for Route 13 in the option that is not fully funded goes in a counterclockwise loop. It would be much better clockwise because people on Olin Avenue have no service to the Transfer Point (TP). [Colin Conn, Metro Scheduler, said he likes the counterclockwise loop because it means a closer bus stop to University. He prefers right turns because it's faster. It also has the bus stopping on the same side of the street as the pool so kids won't have to cross the street.] The pool is open about 3 months of the year whereas people living in that area would have to cross the street to get to the bus stop all the time. The second suggestion is to extend the loop to the South Transfer Point (STP). [Conn said this would not happen without adding buses to the rotation. It creates a can of worms because it would go through the Town of Madison to get to STP.] He also strongly suggested that Metro have these major route changes once every three years instead of every year because its costly, time consuming and very unpleasant for those involved. [Kamp said he hears Ron loud and clear, but there are sometimes new developments that wouldn't get served if Metro didn't make regular changes. DuRocher said he thinks everyone agrees with the idea of less frequent major changes.]

Thomas Mertz, 1210 Gilson Street – He wanted to point out that there are some place in the City you cannot get to without going through the Town of Madison. He thanked Alder Kerr for her work, and said she sends her regrets because she was sick. He felt the information about the route changes was incomplete and difficult, so it was hard to spread the word. He felt that for Route 13 (for which he passed out a map), the short turn campus option was the best choice because it maintains service closest to current service; continues two-way service between downtown and the STP and other frequented locations; it continues direct service from Bay Creek and points south to campus. He preferred the use of Johnson and State rather than Lake and State because it serves more of downtown and has better transfer options. Reasons the other choices for Route 13 are not as optimal include:

- West Washington option
  - o Substantial duplication of Route 5
  - o No direct service to campus area
  - o No service to Ardmore loop
  - o Not clear about Badger/Rimrock vs. Beltline
  - o There was also no draft schedule to consult for this option.
- Olin Loop option
  - o Eliminates service to high use area
  - o No direct service campus area
  - o No connection to STP
  - o There was also no draft schedule to consult for this option.
- Commuterized option
  - o Substantial service cut
  - o AM/PM is confusing
  - o Lose direct in-bound and STP connections at various times
  - o There was a draft schedule, but no map in the current packet.
- Secondary Option
  - o 40/80 minute service – substantial cut

- o 40/80 minute service will be confusing
- o There was no draft schedule to consult.

Greta Hanson, 1717 N Stoughton Road, from the Community Action Coalition for South Central Wisconsin opposed what she believed would be the impact of Route 6 and Route 20 changes for their agency and the people who go there for help. Route 20 was proposed not to service the Kinsman loop. Her agency is on the Frontage Road by Zimbrick next to Ancora. She was trying to find out if there will still be access to the agency, which mostly serves families with small children. [Tim Sobota, Metro Planner, said Route 6 would continue to serve that area weekdays and Route 20 would serve it nights, weekends and holidays. Route 6 changes would require people to exit at Anderson.] Hanson said that would be dangerous and difficult to cross the street for families with small children who might also have bags of clothes. She was concerned about people who need access to services.

Richard Hare, 50 S Gammon Road, was hoping that option 2 for Route 13 works. It would be nicer if it went to the square. For Route 38, he suggested trying to combine both proposals, except for the part that goes on John Nolen and Oakbrigde Avenue. He would like if Metro would consider in the future having it go down to the park and ride. It would help add ridership. Then Metro wouldn't have these budget issues. It currently goes down to the Frontage Road. [Staff said it would be a budget impact. It would add at least one bus to the rotation.] Hare still thought it would be more logical to combine proposals for Route 38.

Kirbie Mack, 2135 Rimrock Road, Department of Revenue (DOR), spoke on behalf of DOR and their employees. They have many employees and families who would be negatively affected by cuts to Route 13. She appreciated the budget problems but asked that this route be exempt from changes. DOR employees work alternative works schedules where shifts can start at 6:00 AM or 5:30 PM. They also have late cleaning crews. Many workers rely on Metro service. The effect of the Route 13 cuts being approved would mean employees could have to take 2 or 3 buses to get to and from work. This would also cause hardship to Allied Drive and South Madison, families who can least afford the change. [DuRocher said proposed changes in Route 13 are a funding issue because the Town of Madison is a funding partner, the same as Fitchburg, Middleton, etc. In order to maintain some equity, the City had managed to get the County to step up and offer some funding because they have facilities served by Route 13. He asked whether there would be a similar avenue to pursue with the State.] Mack said whatever route was taken to approach the County and work in partnership, that approach should be taken with the State Department of Administration.

Linda Ketcham, 2300 S. Park Street, spoke representing the Madison Area Urban Ministry and the impact Route 13 cuts would have on their clients. Many are returning to the community from prison and live in the West Badger, Rimrock, and Ardmore areas. This would have significant impact on their ability to obtain employment. She understands budget issues, but one of the best parole officers is a good job. For a lack of \$26,000 in the short term, we are looking at a minimum cost of \$28,000 to incarcerate one person. She hoped that parties could work together and recognize that these are peoples' lives as well as a public safety issue in recidivism. We want people to rebuild

their lives. It's important that public policy reflect this. [Streit asked between option 1 and option 2, which she would pick for Route 13.] She would pick option 2 because it served Ardmore and Rusk.

Cynthia Higgins, 4205 Bainbridge Street, spoke about Route 38. Putting the route back on Monona Drive helps the people who work at the University or the hospital but doesn't help people working downtown. They'll either have to make a route change if they want to go downtown or get the bus on Monona and then switch on Jenifer Street. Otherwise they walk a mile to catch the Route 3 or get off at the last stop on Jenifer and walk a mile downtown. She wondered about the possibility of getting a stop closer to the intersection of John Nolen and Wilson so it would shorten the walk. There is a reduction in service to every half hour for people working downtown. During the winter the 38 was a very busy route and it was very late, especially during big storms. The 38 going down John Nolen might help increase the speed of the route, but people from the University and hospital can still take the downtown bus, so then it will get overloaded and still make the people going downtown late. [Conn said part of that was response to people who wanted to get to campus. John Nolen is a 3 or 4 minute savings, so it does make the route on time.] She hated to see service cuts when Metro is trying to keep riders. Her concern is that the 38 will get loaded up with the people who don't have to go downtown. You get more ridership by serving the University, but you lose ridership on the other end.

Deena Brazy, 1206 Hickory Street, had registered to speak in opposition to Route 13, option 1 but was not present. Her registration was noted.

Sheila Stubbs, 11 Waunona Woods Ct #2, spoke as a Dane County Board Supervisor (District #23). She wanted to give accolades to Alder Bruer, Alder Kerr and County Board Supervisor Bayrd and staff for working on this issue. She was appalled that a Route 13 reduction for South Madison was even being considered. She was speaking for the most vulnerable people in her district. It's not just a Dane County issue, it's everyone's problem and everyone needs to fix it. She hoped the parties could continue their ongoing partnership. She doesn't know why this route was even considered for elimination. To some people it is life – transportation, daycare, job search or church. It is life. Transportation is not an option but a necessity. Many sites would be affected, including the Huber Center. It could cause approximately maybe 200 Huber guys to be walking through the Capitol View neighborhood. They already have ongoing problems. Why should the neighborhood have these problems because the route gets cut? What about the inmate who has to go to probation and parole? What about people who don't have a voice today that she was there to represent? She wanted the TPC to consider the public safety issue. She has 8 years of experience in probation and parole. She knows the necessity of inmates getting where they need to go. The TPC knows about public safety – 800 people showed up at a public meeting saying we need more police. She is saying we need our bus route. We cannot allow this to happen to South Madison or Route 13. [Poulson asked about discussions with the Town of Madison.] She spoke with the County Executive. The County would be willing to make a split \$9,000 each with the City and Town, contingent upon the City investing. She didn't know what would happen at the County meeting as it was scheduled for after this meeting.

Debby Lynn Aldrich, 3709 Morning Road, Apt. A, registered in support of Route 13, option 2 but did not wish to speak. Her form said she uses Route 13 for the Coliseum and Dane County Expo. She uses Route 6 Hayes Loop and lives on the east side. She also requested that microphones be used at meetings because she could not hear, which is why she did not stay.

James R. Alrich, 3709 Morning Road, Apt. A, registered in support of Route 13, option 2 and echoed the comments by Debby Lynn Aldrich above, including the request for microphones. [Solomon said this registrant has hearing difficulties and has complained about no microphones in the past.]

Lisie Kitchel, 225 Potter Street, registered in support of Route 13, West Washington and short turn campus, option 2. She opposed the other options – option 1, commuterized route. She did not wish to speak.

My Beasley, 5015 Sheboygan Avenue, registered in opposition to severe cuts on needed routes. She did not wish to speak but wrote that \$26,000 seemed like a small amount compared to a large impact the cuts would make for a part of the city that needs the service. We all live in Madison and should take responsibility for our neighbors. She would be willing to pay a higher monthly pass fee to save a Route like 13.

There were no more registrants.

Route 13 option 1 would require \$21,606 from Metro's contingency. Option 2 would require \$52,606. That does not include the \$26,000 needed from the Town of Madison. Discussions with the City, Town of Madison and County were still in the works to see if that \$26,000 could be found.

Discussion regarding Route 38:

- the City pays for the Route, Monona doesn't
- Route 16 also serves parts of Monona Drive
- Buckeye/Davies will have a bus every 15 minutes
- Route 38 and Monona Express (which Madison residents can use) both serve parts of Monona
- Route 38 on John Nolen decreases travel time (in lieu of Route 10)

Staff and Commission members agreed they would like to make service perfect for everyone, but it is always a trade off.

Streit moved to accept the Route 38 proposal. Solomon seconded. The motion carried by voice vote/other.

The discussion moved to the \$26,000 needed for Route 13. Any approval that would require money from Metro's contingency would need Board of Estimates (BOE) approval.

Streit moved to accept Route 13, option 1 unless money that would meet at least 75% of the cost of current service is found by June 21st. Poulson seconded. Hinz offered a friendly amendment that instead of 75% of the cost of current service, it would be for option 2, which makes on-time improvements to the route.

Discussion regarding this motion included:

- The June 21st deadline would still allow route change work to be done by October 5th implementation date
- Metro contingency fund would only have to pay 1/4 of the \$26,000 at most
- Going with option 1 would hurt transit dependent riders
- If Metro bails out one partner, why not all the others
- Other partners would be put off by this, hurting relationships for a regional system in the future
- The Town of Madison will eventually be part of the City or Fitchburg, and no longer a partner as the others are
- There is a huge interconnection between the City of Madison and Town of Madison
- The City, Town, County and State all use the service and could call contribute
- Societal costs of reduced service would be more than the cost of service
- Shifting dollars away from other routes to Route 13 cuts City service in favor of Town of Madison service

DuRocher called for the vote. Hoag and Solomon voted no. Hinz, Poulson and Streit voted aye. DuRocher voted no for a tie. The motion did not pass and was off the table.

Solomon moved to accept Route 13, option 2 as proposed and that the discussions continue to finding all possible sources of funding to ensure that option 2 is funded. Hoag seconded.

Discussion on the Solomon resolution:

- Metro needs clear direction and a timeline in order to do needed work for route changes
- Vote for it and leave it to Metro and the Mayor's office to figure out the funding, even if it all comes from Metro's contingency
- Money used from the contingency will be made up in the future by all partners for the current benefit of one
- Depending on what dollar amount BOE approves from the contingency fund, service could remain the same or go with option 1
- Route 13 should be a priority – if funding is not approved by BOE, all routes should come back to TPC for discussion
- TPC could refer this motion to the June meeting to keep pressure on all potential funding sources
- Although there was some feeling that \$26,000 wasn't a lot, with Metro facing a \$1 million budget shortfall on fuel, every amount needed gets more scrutiny

Voting on Solomon's motion, Streit abstained. All others voted aye. The motion carried by voice vote/other.

[10605](#)

Madison Metro Transit: Revised Recommendations for Fall 2008 Service Changes - TPC 05.27.08

## ADJOURNMENT

Poulson moved to adjourn; Solomon seconded. The motion carried and the meeting was adjourned at 7:35 PM.