



# City of Madison

City of Madison  
Madison, WI 53703  
www.cityofmadison.com

## Meeting Minutes - Approved LANDMARKS COMMISSION

---

Monday, March 10, 2008

4:45 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.  
Room LL-130 (Madison Municipal Building)

---

### CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

**Present:** 6 -

Brenda K. Konkell; Daniel J. Stephans; Stuart Levitan; Robin M. Taylor;  
Michael J. Rosenblum and Erica Fox Gehrig

**Guests:** Mr. Krishna Pradhan, Mr. Steve Janeway, Mr. Todd McGrath, Mr. Jim Eisenmann, Ms. Edna Wetternach, Mr. Philip Marshall, Mr. Jonathan Cooper, Mr. Lance McGrath, Ms. Ledell Zellers

### APPROVAL OF February 25, 2008 MINUTES

*Referred to next meeting.*

### PUBLIC COMMENT

*None.*

### OTHER BUSINESS

1. [09214](#) Lake Park Apartment Homes, 451 West Wilson Street and 315 South Bassett Street- referral from Plan Commission staff for review of new development on parcel adjacent to a Landmark (Dowling Apartment Building, 445 West Wilson Street)

Contact: Lance McGrath, McGrath and Associates

**A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Rosenblum, to recommend to Plan Commission to Approve the project as the Landmarks Commission does not believe that the proposed project is so large or so visually intrusive as to create an adverse effect on the historic integrity of the adjacent Dowling Apartment Building. The motion passed by the following vote:**

**Ayes:** 4 -

Daniel J. Stephans; Stuart Levitan; Robin M. Taylor and Michael J. Rosenblum

**Noes:** 2 -

Brenda K. Konkell and Erica Fox Gehrig

*Mr. McGrath presented an overview of the proposed new apartment building. He said that it would be set back about 20 feet from Wilson St., approximately in line with the Dowling next door. He noted that they had had several neighborhood meetings, one*

*with the entire neighborhood and three or four with a steering committee the neighborhood set up to review the project.*

*He said that the proposed project meets with most of the recommendations in the neighborhood plan, except that it is quite a bit denser than recommended. He said they designed the project to compliment but not imitate the design of the Dowling in scale, proportion, window pattern and front entry. The fourth floor of the new building was set back about 6 feet to reduce the apparent mass of that story.*

*Mr. Todd McGrath noted that their firm has quite a bit of history doing good urban in-fills, including adjacent to Landmarks, such as the Nolen Shores project and the Fourth Ward Lofts adjacent to the Doris House. Mr. Lance McGrath noted that they believe that the new proposal is different from many others in that three sides of the property are public -- two streets and a railroad line. He said that such projects are a good way to fight urban sprawl and increase the economic vitality of the downtown.*

*Mr. Steve Janeway said that the proposed design was overwhelmingly larger than surrounding buildings from certain angles. He said that most people who will view the project and the Dowling will be coming from the west around the corner with Bassett. He said that the upper story should be set back further to minimize its appearance.*

*Mr. Pradhan presented a letter to the Commission that explained his concerns about the proposed project.*

*No one else wished to speak at that time. Ald. Konkol moved that the Landmarks Commission recommend to the Urban Design and Plan Commissions that the proposed design is so large as to overwhelm the historic character of the Dowling apartment building. Ms. Gehrig seconded the motion, which failed on a vote of 5 (Ms. Gehrig, Mr. Levitan, Mr. Rosenblum, Mr. Stephans, Ms. Taylor) to 1 (Ald. Konkol).*

*Ald. Konkol said that she was concerned with this project based on the review of the five-story building that went up next to the Lamp House, noting that the drawings did not sufficiently convey the magnitude of the effect of the new building on the Lamp House. To various questions from the Commission members Mr. McGrath noted that about one third of the building would have decks within 20 feet of the Dowling, but that behind that would be a dead zone of mostly brick wall, corresponding to where the services were inside, and then the rest would face the backyard of the Dowling. He said there was going to be trellis and plants on the rear façade to discourage graffiti. Ms. Wetternach said that the units all have small wall air conditioners, but that residents often had their windows open. Mr. McGrath said that the plan as drawn has as small a footprint as is economically feasible and that they have been working in good faith with the neighborhood and have little time left for delays.*

*Ald. Konkol said that she is concerned with the direction the City is heading by approving large developments downtown to the detriment of the existing neighborhoods. She said it is not just about the height of the building, but also with the bulk and mass. She noted, however, that her opposition was not strenuous.*

*Mr. Stephans said that he thought the developers did a good job of providing set back for the top floor so that pedestrians would not be overwhelmed by the building. Ms. Gehrig said that she believed a deeper setback would have helped diminish the apparent mass, but added that at least no historically interesting buildings are being demolished, as in other projects.*

*Ms. Taylor said that she thought the project had been sensitively designed and that the length of the building on S. Bassett St. was not really an issue. She commended the developers for respecting the design of the Dowling without copying it.*

2.     [07804](#)     Secretary's Report

*Ms. Rankin passed out a picture of a building tentatively proposed for demolition.*

#### ADJOURNMENT

**This meeting was Adjourned at approximately 5:30 p.m.**