

AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: April 1, 2009
TITLE: 202 South Park Street – PUD-SIP for Chandler Street Façade and Emergency Generator Improvements. 13 th Ald. Dist. (12023)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: April 1, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Mark Smith, John Harrington, Richard Slayton, Jay Ferm, Dawn Weber, Marshal Rummel and Todd Barnett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of April 1, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of a PUD-SIP located at 202 South Park Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Melissa Huggins, James Alt, Bob Kramer and Al Hagen.

The modified design as presented emphasize the Chandler Street enclosure details and the following:

- The emergency generator is covered with brick-look fiber cement panels and features simulated arch features similar to those found on the building’s existing facade constructed of EIFS including a stone band extension also constructed of EIFS.
- The existing shed adjacent to the enclosure is concrete block that could be painted to match the EIFS coloration of the simulated brick.

Following the presentation of plans, Commission members made the following comments:

- Problem with proposed archways, elongated and stretched out treatment; its replication of EIFS is not consistent with the rustification of the existing stone and brick along Chandler Street.
- Relevant to the overhead door treatment; use of other architectural approach may be a simple header with brick, no arches. The protective bollards at the door should be painted.
- Concrete block shed should be clad in something more aesthetic.
- Still a problem with interface between old and new at the joint and top edge of the parapet.
- Lose arches across overhead doors; darken down overhead doors.
- The framing on doorways (overhead) need to be reworked; especially darken down the doors.
- Open to another approach for the overhead doors, but like it is “quirky.”
- The use of EIFS not appropriate.
- “People door” is too tightly sandwiched between existing facade and the new overhead doors. Eliminate arch treatment.
- Consider tying arched openings to existing arch opening and look at odd patterning.

- The presentation doesn't match what is in the packet.
- Develop a seamless transition atop to read differently with a redesigned lower facade to work more cohesively with existing line of the existing structure.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Weber, the Urban Design Commission **REFFERED**

CONSIDERATION. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0). The motion to refer provided for address of the above-stated requirements and the following:

- Bring perspective and working drawings which are consistent.
- Look at reworking overhead door handling including providing options the use of EIFS on upper elevations of the enclosure along with adjusting the upper band to read more cohesively with the adjacent existing structure and provide for a different treatment for the lower elevation.
- Look at a different treatment for the people door, reexamining the opening pattern on the enclosure to relate to the patterning on the adjacent existing structure.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5.5, 6, 6, 6 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 202 South Park Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings								5.5
		6					6	6
		6					6	6
	6	6		6		6	6	6
	8	6		8			7	6

General Comments:

- Unresolved issues.
- Lose the arches over the overhead doors!
- Close—but details need resolution.